

Summary Minutes
City of Sedona
Historic Preservation Commission Meeting
City Council Chambers, Sedona City Hall, Sedona, AZ
Monday, March 9, 2009 – 4:00 p.m.

1. Verification of notice, call to order, roll call and Pledge of Allegiance.

Chairman Unger called the meeting to order at 4:01 p.m.

Roll Call:

Commissioners: Chairman Brynn Unger, Vice Chairman Greg Ruland – excused, and Commissioners Richard Mayer, Marjorie Miller and Noreen Wienges

Staff: Kathy Levin and Donna Puckett

Council Member: Vice Mayor Bradshaw

2. Public forum for items not on agenda. Limit of 3 minutes per presentation. (Note that the Commission may not discuss or make any decisions on any matter brought forward by a member of the public).

The Chairman opened the public forum and having no requests to speak, closed the public forum.

3. Consent agenda:

a. Approval of minutes of February 9, 2009 meeting.

The Chairman indicated the Commission needs to approve the minutes of February 9th.

MOTION: *Commissioner Miller so moved. Commissioner Mayer seconded the motion.*

VOTE: *Motion carried four (4) for and zero (0) opposed. (Ruhland excused)*

4. Commission and staff announcements and summary of current matters.

Kathy Levin indicated that she submitted the CLG (Certified Local Government) Grant to request matching funds from the state, to prepare a National nomination of the Saddlerock Ranch, and that is one funding source that has not been impacted by the state budgetary cuts; whereas, the Heritage Grant fund has been suspended, and she was notified that no grants will be considered; that was submitted in December for the Jordan Historical Park for a major \$110,000 rehabilitation project. She wrote, “Sorry, but there will not be any grant cycles in 2009 and possibly 2010. Active grants have been terminated, suspended or given a completion date of March 20, 2009. This is keeping all of grant staff very busy.” Unfortunately, our application wasn’t heard nor awarded, nor will any others be heard or awarded in the second cycle; however, the City budgeted \$60,000 for that grant, and Andi Costello, Director of Parks & Recreation, started meeting with representatives of the Sedona Historical Society and volunteers about getting that work started to the extent that money will cover the most critical improvements.

She received a Certificate of Appropriateness application on behalf of the Jordan Historical Park and that will come to you in April for a public hearing. They are requesting an extension of the shed on the western side of the the barn, and there will be a site visit before

that. There also was a meeting with the applicant's representatives for the Sedona Project, which is a mixed-use project on 15 acres that will be a Planned Area Development, and it includes 6 acres of the Wesleyan Church property, on which the Rigby-Madole adobe house sits, and they will submit their development plans for Conceptual Review. You will be able to comment on those, because of the proximity of the historic structure, and they will probably submit it in the next 60 days.

She has confirmation from Chairman Unger and Commissioner Wienges that they will attend the conference in June, and she also will be attending. If any other Commissioners wish to attend, please let her know this week. We still have two vacancies on the Commission and they have been readvertised, so if you know anyone who is interested, please encourage them to get in touch with her.

5. PUBLIC HEARING: Discussion/possible action regarding a request for an Historic Landmark Designation approval of the Dr. H.H. and Addie Nininger Home (1959) and property. The subject property is further identified as Assessor's Parcel 401-22-010D (Coconino County). Case No.: HL 09-01 (Register Number 020). Applicant: Doris Nininger Banks Address: 39 Meteor Road, Sedona, Arizona 86336

PRESENTATION, Kathy Levin: Provided an overview of the request for Historic Landmark Designation as presented in the Staff Report prepared for March 9, 2009, including the following findings:

- A. Association with events that have made significant contributions to the broad patterns of our history. The original blueprints for this home are dated May 5, 1959 and the Oak Creek Knolls subdivision was recorded on the same date with the County. This is therefore likely to be the first home to be built in the subdivision.
- B. Association with the lives of persons significant in our past. Kathy noted that the Meteor Museum in Sedona was the building that fronts 89A at Arroyo Roble, and that museum was considered one of Howard Madole's first commercial commissions. Today at the site visit, he indicated that commission was \$300. Dr. Nininger's research and scholarship made him the world's foremost expert. Addie Nininger also shared his passion and was a steadfast partner in his work. Construction of the house began in August of 1959 and Madole was paid \$720 for this work, which was carried out under the name of Howard Madole Design, so it is a twin significance, both a prominent occupant and the designer-architect himself manifests this criterion.
- C. Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period or method of construction, or representing the work of a master, or high artistic values or representing a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinctions. This home represents the work of a master, Howard Madole, and it embodies his distinctive architectural features.
- E. Being at least 50 years old, or having achieved significance within the past 50 years if the property is of exceptional importance. It is exactly that, having been constructed in 1959.
- F. Possessing integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling or association. There have been a few changes; on the west side of the home, Doris Banks and her husband constructed a small work space, and the heating & cooling unit was installed, but the integrity of the site and its setting among the natural vegetation on a very large parcel has been maintained, and its integrity has been maintained.

She received four telephone calls from individuals within 300 ft. of the potential designation. Each of them own homes within the area, and of the four, two live in Sedona

and two live outside of Sedona. A common question was, "How will this affect me?", and she explained it will not affect them directly, and moreover, it is felt that historic structures add to the character and contribute to the neighborhood, and all of them were in support of this designation. She believes that this request for Landmark Designation is Doris Banks' way to honor the legacy of her parents and preserve this Madole-designed home, and to make a lasting contribution to Sedona's history. Therefore, staff is supportive of designating the Dr. H. H. and Addie Nininger Home as an historic Landmark, so staff recommends approval of Case No. 09-01, Historic Register No. 020.

APPLICANT, Doris Banks, Sedona, AZ: Indicated that her parents really loved and enjoyed Sedona. This house was the first one they ever were able to own, so they enjoyed their retirement years here. Their children and their families enjoyed coming here and the ones who can still do, and they have great memories of spending vacations here, either with their parents or grandparents, and they have all treasured the experience of being in Sedona. She thinks her parents would have been very honored to have their home remembered in such a way. Thank you.

The Chairman opened the public comment period at this time.

Marlene Tate, Sedona, AZ: Indicated that she lives kitty-corner from Doris, and from the first day she moved into the house almost 7 years ago, Doris' home has always impressed her as an example of how a house could be 50 years old and be so extremely modern, and she wishes more people had homes designed like that, and for that reason alone, she thinks it is worthwhile as an historic landmark.

Paul Domsher, Sedona, AZ: Indicated this is a great idea. He is the former president of the association and one of the nice things about it is you drive by the house, and it always looks nice. The landscaping always looks nice and it is native; there aren't a bunch of plants that don't belong in the subdivision or in Sedona. It is very natural, and he would appreciate it if you would do this for her and her parents, and the grandkids. Thank You.

Linda Yee, Sedona, AZ: Indicated she lives down the street from Doris, and when she moved here about 7 years ago, Doris was one of the first people she met, because of their love of rocks. One of the earliest times she came down was to help identify the rocks that they didn't know, and she did and knew all of their names and they wrote them on a piece of paper. That was the start of a very nice friendship that continued through the time she was on the Historic Preservation Commission, and it dawned on her what a valuable historic home she was living in, so she started talking to her about the possibility of having this home landmarked, and she can't say how thrilled she is to be here today to see that she is agreeing to this and will have a plaque. You have done a wonderful job and the fact that Howard Madole has lent his appreciation and support, she just wishes he was here. If you ever want some good pictures of Addie and H. H. Nininger, she and Doris put together a slide show that was shown at the 50th anniversary of the Gem & Mineral Club here in Sedona, and it starts when they were kids and includes their wedding pictures, and then it goes on up until they lived in this house, and she discovered that their collection is at Arizona State University. He sold it to them and that financed their retirement years. They have seen it there, and it is preserved for all time. If you ever want to see the biggest meteorite collection, it is at Arizona State University and you can go into the vault and hold the pieces that have come from outer space. She is very pleased that his work is being kept forever at ASU and that his home is being kept forever too. Thank you very much.

The Chairman closed the public comment period.

MOTION: Commissioner Miller moved to approve the landmark designation for Case Number HL 09-01 (Historic Register No. 020) to designate the Dr. H. H. and Addie Nininger Home located at 39 Meteor Drive as an historic landmark based upon the consistency with the historic landmark evaluation criteria outlined in the Sedona Land Development Code. Commissioner Wienges seconded the motion. VOTE: Motion carried four (4) for and zero (0) opposed. (Ruland excused)

The Chairman indicated that she was so pleased that Doris brought this to the Commission, because it was a very important home, and ever since Linda Yee brought it to our attention, we were hoping that we could see this day, and we really appreciate this. It now has its place, and we will be coming to your home with a Landmark plaque. She also recognized Jill Sands, another Madole homeowner, and thanked her for attending.

The Chairman recessed the meeting at 4:29 p.m. and reconvened at 4:35 p.m.

6. Discussion/possible action on events for Historic Preservation Month celebration in May 2009.

Chairman Unger indicated that since ILX filed for bankruptcy, she has decided not to continue to try to have them host an event at the Forest Service buildings; she had tried to reach them, but nobody returned her calls, possibly because they were in the midst of dealing with this situation. She called the Eilenbergs and asked if they would be interested in holding an event at their home, and they have said yes, but they can only do it on the weekends. She also met with Janeen Trevillyan who said she would be willing to help with an event, so she would like for Janeen and Commissioner Miller to take care of the refreshments. She also asked if Commissioner Mayer would be willing to work with them to develop a display of the before and after. We had discussed possibly award a plaque or a Certificate of Excellence, and she had brought to everyone's attention the one that the Florida Keys Foundation presents every year, which we may not need to do annually, but it would be nice to promote renovation and rehabilitation of homes periodically, with an award. This year we possibly could award them a Certificate of Excellence for having returned this Madole home to its original state. There are a few additions, but for the most part, the home looks almost identical to what it was originally, both interior and exterior.

If Commissioner Mayer worked with them to show the before and after, and Commissioner Miller and Janeen could work on the refreshments, we have to determine what weekend in May we could do this. She is hesitant to determine the date now, since the Vice Chairman isn't here. The first weekend would be very difficult, because Chamber Music and the Historical Society are both doing something, so any of the other three weekends in May.

Commissioner Mayer asked if the Eilenbergs realize this is going to be a public event, and Chairman Unger indicated that we need to talk with them further, but she mentioned that in December. She and Kathy had discussed the possibility of offering insurance on it, and Kathy mentioned some protective plastic for the floors. We don't want any public impact and any refreshments served would be outside, and they wouldn't be able to carry it in. We want it to be a class act, and we want to do it with all respect to that house.

Kathy indicated that for the Open House at the Doodlebug Ranch, we made sure there was a designated person in each room and that could extend to other volunteers, so we keep a

watchful eye. Commissioner Mayer indicated that would be a necessity. Kathy added that the Eilenbergs documented the before and after, so it should be a great exhibit.

Commissioner Mayer asked what kind of reproductions we are talking about, and the Chairman indicated that we will probably have to do something smaller in size but not quality, but she would like to do something that is nice. Commissioner Mayer pointed out it would depend on the budget. Kathy clarified she was referencing before and after photographs. The Chairman indicated that she and Kathy would need to come up with a budget for this, but she would like to give Commissioner Mayer most of that budget. The Commissioner indicated that the first step would be to make clear to them what is involved, and the Chairman indicated that she will be in touch with them.

Kathy indicated that Janeen is doing the walking tour for the Commission on the first Saturday in May, Mother's Day is Sunday the 10th and Memorial Day is the last weekend and she will be gone. We may want to talk with the Eilenbergs about the 9th or the 16th or 17th in the afternoon. The Chairman indicated she will talk with them about that; she would like for it to be really classy and a little different than we have done in the past, and maybe we can come up with that Certificate of Excellence; this may encourage them to think about landmarking. Kathy indicated that we could agendize the certificate in April, if you want to bring that back for discussion.

Commissioner Miller asked about the entertainment budget for this year, and Kathy indicated that she can email that to her. Commissioner Miller pointed out that lemonade and cookies may not be appropriate, so we have to think about our budget. The Chairman indicated that she would also like to feature the other two landmarked Madole homes as well. Commissioner Miller indicated that she can get the same women volunteers again, and Commissioner Wienges indicated that she will help Commissioner Miller.

7. Discussion/possible action on 2008-09 Commission Work Plan and commissioner involvement in Work Plan tasks:

a. Education and Public Outreach

The Chairman indicated she has printed the brochure on the Endangered Places, but when she readjusted everything, there is one glitch in it. Copies were distributed, and she indicated the order was changed a little, including a wording change for the Post Office and the Madole-Rigby House, because it was on a 10-acre parcel before. Kathy explained they sold some acreage to the former Windsong site. The Chairman also pointed out that when the brochure was changed from one software to another, it changed the color of the picture of the ditch, but she will see if she can correct that. The Commissioners indicated that it looked good. Chairman Unger acknowledged the two wonderful articles in the paper. Susan Johnson interviewed her, Howard Madole and Janeen Trevillyan, and she really appreciates Vice Chairman Ruland and Susan Johnson for those articles.

b. Survey Field Work

The Chairman indicated that next month we have far too much to look at the survey, and Commissioner Mayer indicated that it is not complete, because we lost three areas. We are waiting on a CD from Janeen Trevillyan, but there is nothing from Juniper, Sedona West and Sedona Meadows; he suggested that if we don't get any material, we should re-shoot, with one or two people maximum and one camera. The Chairman

indicated that we will see if those have come in by the next meeting, and then make a determination as to whom. It would be nice if Commissioner Wienges is involved.

c. Madole Home landmark prospects

The Dr. H. H. and Addie Nininger House was designated under agenda item 5; there was no additional discussion regarding Madole homes.

8. Discussion/possible action on:

a. Prospects for designation of landmarks or historic districts

The Chairman indicated that she, Commissioner Wienges and Commissioner Miller visited the Cooper-Williams House; it is very nice little house, and she gave Kathy her notes. It is a very odd color for an historic building of that timeframe; however, all the board and batten looks original and the stone fireplace is original; there is also a little patio on the left side that is original, so it is worth a second look. It is certainly the style of house for that neighborhood and the vernacular of that timeframe, so we may want the other Commissioners to take a second look at it. They also have a little step wall in front, but they put in some adobe and may have filled in the garage a little. We need to recognize that they have offered this house and would like for us to look at it.

Commissioner Mayer indicated he talked with a family on Johnny Guitar Street and it is a house he purchased when he moved here. It is a Don Woods' house, and he (the Commissioner) did some changes to it, but nothing structurally out of appropriateness, and Mr. Woods okayed everything. He found his blueprints in the wall, and they are interested in landmarking it, but it is not 50 years old. It was designed in 1969, but Mr. Woods has done over 200 structures here, and some of his early work is very interesting. He was doing things in the realm of Wright and Madole, but some of them almost have a Japanese influence in them. The Chairman noted that we had discussed if we wanted to look at other architects in the area, and she thinks we could do that; we have few very old buildings, so if we look at our history, it is a lot shorter than a lot of other cities, and it may be appropriate to take a look at that, because Don Woods does have history here and has made a name for himself as a local architect. We might see if there was anyone of importance who lived in that home too.

Commissioner Mayer indicated it is in Sedona West and was built a few years after Jill Sands' house, and some of the other houses were built in the mid to late 60s. It was built for a sculptress and it is a high-quality home, but because of the age factor, he didn't know if he should take it any further. He has some original pictures of it, before he made some changes.

Kathy indicated it would be safe to say that home is on its way to being historic, but given the criteria for landmark designation, it needs to be at least 50 years of age or having achieved significance within the past 50 years and is of exceptional importance. The Chairman indicated she wondered if we could consider it was one of Don Woods' first homes or consider the artist, as somebody of importance; that would be something we could look into. Kathy indicated she has repeatedly told Mr. Woods that we want a list of his work, because it is important, and Commissioner Mayer has done us a service to single out this architect, and we should have him create a compendium of his houses, so we have that information that only he can provide about their original construction and for whom, etc. The Chairman agreed, and Kathy suggested inviting him to a

meeting to get his attention in a different way, and to be able to discuss our interest in his work. Commissioner Mayer indicated he has also asked him, but he doesn't think it is very important. Chairman Unger indicated that inviting him to a meeting is not a bad idea; Kathy will contact him for May.

b. Certificates of Appropriateness

Chairman Unger indicated that we will have a Certificate of Appropriateness next month for the Jordan Historical Park. Kathy added that we have two for April; that is one and the other is KSB for a Ramada, patio and new plantings, and since they are a designated Landmark, you will have the opportunity to review those improvements.

c. Updates to Historic Resource Survey

Kathy indicated this item was the Cooper house, so there was no further discussion.

d. Condition of Landmarks or other historic properties

Kathy Levin indicated that a letter was sent to the President of KSB advising them they were in violation of the Land Development Code regarding the work that had been performed on the Pushmataha building, in conjunction with the work they were carrying out under a small grant assistance program, and today she received a response from the President, in addition to numerous photo attachments and an history of the project from Cole Greenberg, and because we just received this material today, she would recommend designating a couple of Commissioners and staff to get together with the parties to resolve this and report back in April. She forwarded this information to you, but there wasn't sufficient time for you to read and discuss it, and she also is not prepared to do that.

The Chairman asked Commissioner Mayer if he would be willing to discuss it, but he indicated he has a lot of other things going on with the survey and the Eilenbergs; however, you have to read all of the material, because there is more involved than just the materials used. The Chairman agreed we need a chance to review it. Commissioner Wienges indicated she is willing to get involved as a diplomat, but she doesn't have the expertise to discuss the building aspects of it, but if she went with someone with that expertise fine. The Chairman indicated that she and Commissioner Wienges will work with staff and Commissioner Miller indicated she would be willing to pitch in with them, if the Chairman wishes to have a third person.

9. Discussion/possible action regarding future meeting dates and future agenda items.

Chairman Unger indicated we have to move April's meeting, and we have the room on April 20th. The Commissioners indicated that would work, and we will check with Vice Chairman Ruland also. We will not be discussing Form-Based Codes next month, but we will finish discussing our May event, and we will have three public hearings, so we will be in Chambers again. One hearing will be the Doodlebug Ranch, and she will try to show it to Commissioner Wienges; Vice Chairman Ruland needs to do a site visit also. For the Pushmataha site and the Jordan Historical Park, we will do site visits. It was determined that the Commission will meet at City Hall at 2:30 p.m. and go in the van.

The Chairman distributed information on Form-Based Codes for the Commissioners to review. Kathy indicated that she and Mike Raber would be able to give them an overview, and they were tentatively considering doing that in May. The Chairman referenced the Residential Design Guidelines and indicated those will be incorporated, so will look at that too, plus she has a booklet from Bisbee; it was their Civic Town Plan and it is fascinating. They attended the HP Conference two summers ago and distributed these, so that will probably be in May, but she wants the Commission to have an understanding of what Form-Based Codes are.

10. Adjournment.

The Chairman called for adjournment at 5:13 p.m., without objection.

Respectfully Submitted,

Donna A. S. Puckett, *Recording Secretary*